



Amsterdam, 29 February 2024

**OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights
Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department**

Ul. Miodowa 10
00-251
Warsaw, Poland

Subject: Informing your organisation about the Report on "*Hate Crimes Against the Gülen Movement in Turkey*" prepared by **Stichting Justice Square** to identify hate crimes against the Gülen Movement in Turkey and to contribute to the annual reports prepared by the **OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights** in this context.

Introduction

1. Hate speech against the Gülen Movement¹ in Turkey, which started with the 17/25 December bribery and corruption operations, became a state policy with the 15 July coup attempt. This study on hate policies against the Gülen Movement in Turkey was conducted by **Stichting Justice Square** in order to combat these hate policies that pave the way for the commission of hate-motivated crimes against humanity in Turkey, to reveal the perpetrators of these acts, to explain the hate policies of the Erdoğan regime to the whole world, to identify the recent hate crimes and reflect them in international reports, and most importantly, to raise awareness in the international community on this issue.

1 The Gülen Movement (also known as Hizmet Movement) is a group of religious, educational and social organisations in Turkey and abroad, founded and inspired by Fethullah Gülen. In May 2016, Turkey designated the movement a terrorist organisation, referring to it as the Fethullah Terrorist Organisation (FETO).

2. This study was sent to your organisation in order to contribute to the annual reports prepared by the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights on hate crimes committed in member states. Your institution was previously notified about the hate crimes committed in 2022.
3. In order to clarify that the acts committed against the Gülen Movement in Turkey were motivated purely by hate rather than political motivation and struggle, the following points need to be explained. However, hate crimes committed against the Gülen Movement in 2023 will be reported separately.
4. At this point, the true extent of hate crimes committed against the Gülen Movement in Turkey will be able to be revealed after the Erdoğan regime collapses and the extent of the damage is assessed. Under these circumstances, we have tried to explain the hate policies and discriminatory regime practices in Turkey through the statements of the victims who contacted our foundation and the examples obtained through internet news platforms and social media. The information and the cases obtained under limited conditions reveal that these are not individual violations of rights, but a systematic product of the Erdoğan regime's hate policies.

A. The Beginning Process of Hate Policies Against the Gülen Movement in Turkey

5. It is a well-known fact that hate speech emerges in many societies in certain periods due to political and social developments. In Turkey, certain individuals, groups, and organisations have been targeted by hate speech in certain periods. As a result of the lack of development of a democratic social structure in Turkey and the transformation of society into an apparatus of politics, it is a known fact that in every period, thoughts and formations that adopt anti-democratic and inhumane practices based on politics have come to life. Antidemocratic formations and their political extensions, which consider social differences as an element that needs to be destroyed or marginalised rather than seeing them as a richness, have always been in a position based on marginalisation, ignoring the rights of the other, spreading, promoting, and defending intolerance and hatred. Accordingly, social groups such as Kurds, Romani citizens, Armenians, Christians, and Jews, as well as other immigrant groups, especially Syrians, who have recently had to migrate to Turkey due to war and internal conflicts, have frequently been the targets of hate speech in Turkey. The most recent target group of hate speech and crime in Turkey has been the Gülen Movement.

6. The Gülen Movement, which has been targeted by hate politics in Turkey, is a contemporary movement that stands out with its educational and cultural activities in Turkey and bases its work on dialogue and tolerance². The Gülen Movement, which cannot harmonise with and does not fall under the will of the Justice and Development Party (AKP) regime in Turkey that pursues a policy based on political Islam, has been targeted by the most intense, large-scale, and systematic hate speech campaign in the country's history. Especially after the 17/25 December corruption and bribery investigations involving the Erdoğan regime began, the Gülen Movement has been the target of a systematic, planned and an ultimate hate policy based on exclusion and erasure from society³.
7. The matured hate policies have been transformed into a state policy by citing the 15 July coup attempt as an excuse. People have been left to civilian death both in prisons and in civilian life under the influence of this hate policy. Especially those who were dismissed from their positions in the public sector with the State of Emergency Decree Laws have become the first-degree addressees of hate speech in society.
8. By means of its institutionalised propaganda structure, the Erdoğan regime in Turkey has systematically and deliberately started to use the terms "*fetö, fetö/pdy, fethullahist terrorist organisation, traitor, coup plotter, virus, hashishashi, agent, puppet, servant of foreign powers, etc.*" against the Gülen Movement in every incident in favour of the government or in every case where the government is in trouble. The members of the movement have been the victims of these hateful discourses, discriminatory regime practices and unlawful judicial decisions that undermine human dignity.

B. Transformation of Hate Speech into Hate Crimes

9. Hate speech and discriminatory state practices in Turkey, which started with the 17/25 December bribery and corruption operations and became a state policy with

2 For detailed information see: Özdalga, Elisabeth: 'Worldly Asceticism in Islamic Casting: Fethullah Gülen's Inspired Piety and Activism', Critique, no. 17 (Fall 2000): 83-104; Turam, Berna: 'Between Islam and the State: The Politics of Engagement: The Engagements between the Gülen Community and the Secular Turkish State', Doktora Tezi, McGill University, Montreal, 2001; Ergil, Doğu: Fethullah Gülen & The Gülen Movement İn 100 Questions, Blue Dome Press (17 Dec. 2012); Agai, Bekim: Fethullah Gülen Hareketinin Eğitim İslamî Etik Kazandırma Projesi, 27.02.2003, <https://fgulen.com/tr/hayati-tr/hareketi-incelemeler/Bekim-Agai-Fethullah-Gulen-Hareketinin-Egitime-Islami-Etik-Kazandırma-Projesi>

3 For detailed information see: "2013 corruption scandal in Turkey", https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/2013_corruption_scandal_in_Turkey

the 15 July coup attempt, have also found a response in the society. Hate policies developed by the members of the government and the state officials have been directly translated into action and very serious hate crimes have started to emerge. The process that started with hate speech has been replaced by hate crimes. When the hate speech is analysed in depth, it is clear that it ultimately aims to cause violence.

10. In this context, due to the chaotic environment in Turkey, the public officials have committed acts of violence, threats, injuries, and harassment against the members of the Gülen Movement in prisons, detention centres and in civilian life. The fact that similar acts were perpetrated by civilians motivated by hate has made the situation more serious. Hate speech has been met in society with violence.
11. The politics of hatred carried out by the Erdoğan regime first turned into state violence and finally into social violence. In other words, the state directly used the language of hate. In this context, the statements made by public figures in the media openly against the Gülen Movement such as *"15 July remained inside me, our family would take 50 people"⁴*, *"How will you protect your wife and children from us?"⁵* and *"Do you know about the stashes, lists and what will happen?"⁶* clearly reveal the point of social hatred. These expressions also show how the language of hatred desired to be created in the society has been accepted.
12. Hate policies created against the Gülen Movement have led to the acts of torture, ill-treatment, insult, and intentional injury by public officials in prisons against the detainees or convicts allegedly belonging to the Gülen Movement. Especially the acts of violence in prisons and detention centres constitute the gravest examples of state violence within the scope of hate policy.
13. One of the ultimate goals of hate speech as a policy of the Erdoğan regime is to incite violence against the movement and its members. Hate speech used against members of the Gülen Movement normalises and legitimises discrimination, harassment, and physical attacks. The aim of this incitement to violence is not only

4 '15 Temmuz içimde kaldı, bizim aile 50 kişiyi götürür' diyen Sevda Noyan'a ailesinden hakaret davası', 10.05.2020, <https://tr.euronews.com/2020/05/10/15-temmuz-icimde-kald-bizim-aile-50-kisiyi-goturur-diyen-sevda-noyan-a-ailesinden-hakaret>,

5 'Bir tehdit de Fatih Tezcan'dan: Karınızı, çocuklarınızı nasıl koruyacaksınız bizden?' 12.05.2020, <https://halktv.com.tr/gundem/bir-tehdit-de-fatih-tezcandan-karinizi-cocuklarinizi-nasil-koruyacaks-424992h>,

6 'Fatih Tezcan: Bir daha sokağa çıkarsak listelerden, kimleri toplayacağımızdan haberiniz var mı; karınızı, çocuğunuzu nasıl koruyacaksınız?', 11.05.2020, <https://t24.com.tr/haber/fatih-tezcan-bir-daha-sokaga-cikarsak-listelerden-kimleri-toplayacagimizdan-haberiniz-var-mi-karinizi-cocugunuzu-nasil-koruyacaksiniz,877941>

to encourage civilians to resort to violence against the members of the Movement, but also to encourage the public officials, who are motivated by this hate speech, to resort to violence. As a natural consequence of the acceptance of hate speech in society, many acts of violence have already started to take place.

14. The Erdoğan regime's policies of incitement to violence against the Gülen Movement have been reciprocated in many segments of society. Sedat Peker, the leader of the organised crime organisation, said at the 15 July themed event programme held on 15 July 2017: "*...As they think, the prisons will be raided one day. But I swear it is not as they imagine. We will enter those prisons after hanging all those we caught outside on trees and flagpoles. We will hang them in prisons too. We will hang them by their necks on flagpoles...*"⁷ statements contain hatred, violence, and open threats. The Istanbul Anatolian 41st Criminal Court of First Instance acquitted Sedat Peker on the charge of "*public incitement to commit a crime*" due to this statement. In the justification for acquittal, it was emphasised that it is the duty of every Turkish citizen to stand by the state and the nation against terrorist organisations and that the addressees of the defendant Peker's words were the members and sympathisers of the terrorist organisation named FETÖ/PDY and that the decision of acquittal was given since it did not contain an element of crime⁸.

C. Transition from Hate Crimes to Crimes Against Humanity

15. It is obvious that the hate speech developed by the Erdoğan regime against the Gülen Movement paved the way for hate crimes. However, it has been observed in the process that these acts are not limited to hate crimes, but those hate crimes have turned into qualified crimes against humanity.
16. The Erdoğan regime's messages titled "*fetö(!)*" with the content of "*betrayal gang... hashashis*⁹... *viruses... if you pity them, you will be in a position begging for pity*", are aimed at destroying the Gülen Movement and cleansing it from the society. The regime repeats these messages in order to sustain social motivation and hatred in

7 "Sedat Peker: Onları, boyunlarından bayrak direklerine asacağız, Azrail'den memuriyet dileyin!"; 16.07.2017, <https://t24.com.tr/haber/sedat-peker-onlari-boyunlarindan-bayrak-direklerine-asacagiz-azrailden-memuriyet-dileyin,414672>

8 "Mahkeme Sedat Peker'in beraat gerekçesinde övgü dolu sözler kullandı", 16.08.2018, <https://www.evrensel.net/haber/357048/mahkeme-sedat-pekerin-beraat-gerekcesinde-ovgu-dolu-sozler-kullandi>,

9 Haşhaşis (Assassins) are a religious sect and political organization founded by Hasan Sabbah (in 1090), a cleric belonging to the Shi'a sect. It is used as an insult and accusation in Turkish. Thus, it is implied that the sheikh secretly made his followers drink poppy and made them do all kinds of evil. (Order of Assassins, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Order_of_Assassins)

the society on the way to this goal. The ultimate result of these messages is the commission of crimes against humanity.

17. The United Nations Human Rights Council Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, in several resolutions on the applications of victims of the Gülen Movement volunteers, has clearly emphasised that the campaign of mass arrests and detentions against the Gülen Movement alone, let alone killings and torture, could constitute crimes against humanity¹⁰. Similarly, the UN independent expert Alfred de Zayas, in his article dated 26 February 2021, stated that eight of the ten stages of genocide (classification, symbolisation, discrimination, dehumanisation, organisation, polarisation, preparation, persecution, excluding extermination and denial) have taken place so far with the attacks on the Gülen Movement volunteers¹¹. In short, there is no doubt that the acts against Gülen Movement volunteers constitute crimes against humanity.
18. The acts of denigration, targeting and antagonisation against the Gülen Movement have now come to a stage at which violence is aimed. In this category, direct incitement to violence and the expressions that may ultimately amount to genocide or crimes against humanity are used. In particular, the expressions such as *"we will eradicate, we will clean up, we will not leave a single individual, we will not recognise the right to life, we will bury"* are common expressions of this category. In fact, the discourses in this category first manifest themselves through hate crimes. Afterwards, the risk of committing other crimes against humanity increases. The ultimate goal of discourses in this category is to commit or encourage the commission of these crimes¹².

D. Transformation of Hate Speech into Violence, Torture and Ill-Treatment

19. As it has been emphasised before, discrimination, harassment, threats, physical violence, and similar unjust acts have started to be committed and very serious human rights violations have emerged with the spread of hate speech within the framework of a policy and its legitimisation in society. As a result of hate policies,

10 United Nations, Human Rights Council Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Detention/Opinions/Session88/A_HRC_WG_AD_2020_51_Advance_Edited_Version.pdf

11 Alfred de Zayas: Crimes Against Humanity in Erdogan's Turkey, 26.02.2021, [https://www.realclearreligion.org/articles/2021/02/26/crimes against humanity in erdogans turkey 661936.html](https://www.realclearreligion.org/articles/2021/02/26/crimes%20against%20humanity%20in%20erdogans%20turkey%20661936.html)

12 "Gülen Hareketi Mensuplarına Karşı Yürütülen Nefret Suçu İzleme Projesi", <https://nefretsucu.com/hakkimizda>,

not only the rights of individuals to be free from violence have been violated, but also their lives, property, material, and moral assets have been under attack. In particular, because of hate speech, there have been cases of harassment by mail, e-mail, telephone, message or graffiti, or direct violence and harassment due to the fact that the person is on trial for membership of an organisation or has been dismissed by a state of emergency decree. Similarly, criminal acts such as torture, ill-treatment and strip searches have been committed in prisons and detention centres purely motivated by hate.

20. In fact, especially in the process that turned into a witch hunt after the 15 July coup attempt, very serious hate crimes were committed against the Gülen Movement. However, due to the chaotic environment created by the State of Emergency, victims could not even file criminal complaints against these acts. Likewise, due to the restrictions on independent media and pressure on civil society organisations, these issues could not be presented to the public. However, in the course of time, victims have started to talk about their grievances, especially on social media. Although it has been almost 8 years since the coup attempt, the hate-motivated crimes against the Gülen Movement are being committed continuously. In order to understand the problem, it is useful to give a few recent cases as examples. In this context:

- Emine Özdemir Kara, who was dismissed from her job as a classroom teacher in 2016 with a Decree Law, was frequently subjected to accusatory statements such as 'terrorist', 'traitor' and physical beatings by her neighbours and tenants in her house in Fevziçakmak Neighbourhood of Tepebaşı District of Eskişehir. Emine Özdemir Kara and her brother were excluded from their neighbourhood after they were dismissed by a state of emergency decree, marginalised and repeatedly insulted. Kara, who was previously beaten for this reason and filed a complaint with the police, did not get any result. The incident was also brought to the parliamentary agenda by HDP Kocaeli MP Ömer Faruk Gergerlioğlu¹³.
- R. Y., who lives in Kamen in North Rhine-Westphalia, Germany, was beaten by a person of Turkish origin on the grounds that he is a member of the Gülen Movement. In the incident that took place on 18 May 2022, R. Y., who has been living in Germany for 41 years, was subjected to hate crime and assaulted by

13 "Tüm mahalle KHK'liye karşı: 'Vatan haini' dediler, darp ettiler", 19.04.2022, <https://www.gazeteduvar.com.tr/tum-mahalle-khkliye-karsi-vatan-haini-dediler-darp-ettiler-haber-1561202> ; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AXv2jKjVibU>,

the new owner of the doner shop named Ö.K. H., where he went with his daughter and son-in-law, claiming that R. Y. was a '**terrorist**'. The assault marks on R.Y.'s body were identified by the police and hospital report¹⁴.

- Ahmet Dönmez, a journalist and the former Ankara correspondent of Zaman' Newspaper, which was close to the Gülen Movement and shut down by a state of emergency decree, ~~who~~ was threatened with death a while ago by the mafia close to former Interior Minister Süleyman Soylu, and was attacked in front of his child on 18/03/2022 in Stockholm, following his video on YouTube "*The rise story of Ayhan Bora Kaplan, the mafia of Süleyman Soylu*" by İhsan Hızarcı, the mafia mentioned in the video. Dönmez, who lost consciousness due to the attack, was taken under treatment in hospital. Immediately after the incident, a photo of the journalist on the ground in a wounded state was shared by Twitter accounts close to the Erdoğan regime to intimidate the public¹⁵.

- The pool media, which plays the role of the main actor in the proliferation of hate speech in Turkey, occasionally publishes news with concrete targets that they want hate speech to result in violence. In this context, the car of former Police Chief Murat Çetiner, who lives in Sweden and was targeted by Sabah newspaper on 25 October 2022, was attacked on 04/11/2022. The window of his car was broken. Sabah newspaper's 'special intelligence chief' Abdurrahman Şimşek, who works closely with the National Intelligence Agency (MİT), had recently targeted many people living abroad, including Murat Çetiner. In its article on Murat Çetiner, Sabah openly published all the personal details of the former police chief, including his home address, his car and the places where he went shopping¹⁶.

- The newspaper had targeted Cevheri Güven, Abdullah Bozkurt, Bülent Keneş¹⁷ and Levent Kenez, journalists living in Sweden and Germany and close

14 "Cemaat'e yönelik nefret suçu Almanya'ya taşındı; 'terörist' diyerek darp ettiler" 18.05.2022, <https://www.tr724.com/cemaate-yonelik-nefret-sucu-almanyaya-tasindi-terorist-diyerek-darp-ettiler/>

15 "Soylu'nun mafyasının ölümle tehdit ettiği gazeteci Ahmet Dönmez İsveç'te çocuğunun gözü önünde saldırıya uğradı", 18.03.2022, <https://boldmedya.com/2022/03/18/soylunun-mafyasinin-olumle-tehdit-ettiler-gazeteci-ahmet-donmez-isvecte-cocugunun-gozu-onunde-saldiriya-ugradi/>

16 "Sabah gazetesi hedef göstermişti; Murat Çetiner'in aracına saldırı", 04.11.2022, <https://www.tr724.com/sabah-gazetesi-hedef-gostermisti-murat-cetinerin-aracina-saldiri/>

17 "Son dakika | FETÖ ihanetinin sözcüsü Levent Kenez, İsveç'te saklanıyor", 04.11.2022, <https://www.sabah.com.tr/galeri/gundem/son-dakika-feto-ihanetinin-sozcusu-levent-kenez-isvecte-saklaniyor>,

to the Gülen Movement. The newspaper had targeted Cevheri Güven, an exiled journalist living in Germany, by secretly taking photographs of him and his house¹⁸. The newspaper targeted Abdullah Bozkurt, the former Ankara Representative of the shut-down Today's Zaman newspaper and Editor-in-Chief of Nordic Monitor, who lives in Stockholm, by publishing his personal information such as photographs, the bus stop he uses for transport and the address of his house¹⁹.

- AKP MP Mustafa Açıkgöz targeted Kurds and the members of the Gülen Movement during a visit program at the Neuss Ülkü Ocakları²⁰ in Düsseldorf, North Rhine-Westphalia, Germany and said: *"We will not give them the right to live in Germany as we do not give them the right to live in Turkey. We will not give them a place in Turkey. God willing, we have finished them there, wherever in the world they are hiding, we will bring them out of the hole they are hiding in and destroy them"* and threatened the members of the Gülen Movement abroad with death²¹. Cologne police started an investigation against AKP Nevşehir MP Mustafa Açıkgöz, who committed a hate crime due to his open death threats against Kurds and the members of the Gülen Movement.

21. As it can be seen, it is observed that the hate policies at domestic are also being implemented abroad. In this context, an MP of the ruling party openly threatened the members of the Gülen Movement in a non-governmental organisation. Since this threatening discourse falls within the scope of hate crime, it also reveals the sphere of influence of the Erdoğan regime's hate policies.

22. On the other hand, the hate-motivated discriminatory regime practice that has recently come to the public agenda is the torture, ill-treatment, beatings, insults, threats and strip search practices in detention centres and prisons. This problem, which was brought to the agenda by HDP MP Ömer Faruk Gergerlioğlu and other non-governmental organisations, was met with intense reactions from the society

18 "SABAH, firari FETÖ'cü Cevheri Güven'i Almanya'daki adresinde görüntüledi: İşte tetikçinin iftira yuvası", 22.09.2022, <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2022/09/22/sabah-firari-fetocu-cevheri-guveni-almanyadaki-adresinde-goruntuledi-iste-tetikcinin-iftira-yuvasi>, İET:10/08/2023

19 "İşte o FETÖ'cü Abdullah Bozkurt'un son hali", 10.10.2022, <https://www.sabah.com.tr/galeri/gundem/son-dakika-sabah-karlov-suikastinin-planlayicisini-buldu-iste-o-fetocunun-son-hali/11>,

20 "Ülkü Ocakları" is a Turkish far-right paramilitary organization associated with the Nationalist Movement Party (MHP). Sometimes referred to as Grey Wolves, the organization is often described as ultra-nationalist and/or neo-fascist. (Grey Wolves (organization), [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Grey_Wolves_\(organization\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Grey_Wolves_(organization)))

21 "AKP'li vekilin Almanya'daki konuşmasına tepki", 16.01.2023, <https://www.dw.com/tr/akpli-vekilin-almanyadaki-konu%C5%9Fmas%C4%B1-tepkilere-yol-a%C3%A7t%C4%B1/a-64403966>

and the state institutions, especially the Ministry of Interior, hastily made statements denying the allegations and claiming that these were isolated incidents.

23. The reports prepared by the Ankara Bar Association Human Rights Centre revealed that members of the Gülen Movement were insulted, threatened, injured, sexually assaulted, ill-treated, and tortured in detention by police officers working at the Ankara Provincial Security Directorate TEM Branch Directorate. Upon receiving reports of torture, insults, threats, and sexual assaults against the individuals detained by the Ankara Security Directorate on the allegation of being members of the Gülen Movement, the Ankara Bar Association Human Rights Centre interviewed these detainees at the Ankara Provincial Security Directorate TEM Branch Directorate and prepared the reports dated 26.01.2022²², 02.03.2022²³ and 04.04.2022²⁴.
24. The hate policies, which have become a state policy, lie at the root of acts of torture. The acts of torture are committed in detention and prisons with the motive of hate. These acts are carried out with the motive of hatred. Strip searches are systematically applied in detention centres and prisons in Turkey and cannot be considered as isolated cases²⁵.
25. It is understood that, as in other acts of torture against the members of the Gülen Movement, the detainees alleged to be members of the movement were forced to become confessors through threats and insults; they were subjected to beatings and kicks to the different parts of their bodies; they were subjected to strip searches as well as threats and insults during interviews; they were subjected to insults, threats and threats to insert bottles or other objects into their anus while naked; and they were doused twice with cold water.

22 Ankara Barosu 67. Olağan Genel Kurulunda Alınan Tavsiye Kararı Doğrultusunda Yayınlanan İnsan Hakları Merkezi Raporları, 02.01.2023, https://ankarabarusu.org.tr/upload/diger/raporlar/26.01.2022_tarihli_ihm_rapor.pdf

23 Ankara Barosu, 67. Olağan Genel Kurulunda Alınan Tavsiye Kararı Doğrultusunda Yayınlanan İnsan Hakları Merkezi Raporları, 02.01.2023, https://ankarabarusu.org.tr/upload/diger/raporlar/02.03.2022_tarihli_ihm_rapor.pdf

24 Ankara Barosu, 67. Olağan Genel Kurulunda Alınan Tavsiye Kararı Doğrultusunda Yayınlanan İnsan Hakları Merkezi Raporları, 02.01.2023, https://ankarabarusu.org.tr/upload/diger/raporlar/04.04.2022_tarihli_ihm_rapor1.pdf,

25 "Female students strip-searched, denied right to consult lawyer", 08.09.2020, <https://stockholmcf.org/female-students-strip-searched-denied-right-to-consult-lawyer/>

E. Continuation of Hate Policies Unabated

26. Starting in 2016, hate speech is still implemented as a state policy and the members of the movement are constantly targeted by political elements and citizens.
27. Brussels-based "Solidarity with OTHERS" within the scope of the **Hate Crime Monitoring Project against The Members of the Gülen Movement** coordinated by the platform, a total of **917,061** hate speech expressions were identified as a result of the analyses conducted on **19 broadcast platforms** and **473** columnists in the central media between 2015 and 2020. Hate speech in these publications was categorised under 4 categories²⁶:
1. Intolerance, exaggeration, attribution, distortion (10927 publications)
 2. Attack on rights and reputation, swearing, insult, denigration (3088 publications)
 3. Incitement to enmity, discrimination, violence (159837 publications)
 4. Incitement to genocide/crimes against humanity (685 publications)
28. In fact, this discourse, which has been transformed into a state policy since 2016, has been used as the main fuel of a process that has evolved into social genocide. The process that started with the 15 July coup attempt, which was evaluated by Erdoğan as *"a gift from God"*, and the hate speech against the Gülen Movement, has turned into a genocide within the framework of the determined plan. In this context, Erdoğan's statement on 15/02/2024 on his return from his visit to Egypt, *"We have broken the back of this evil network and terrorist organisation called FETO. We have drained the FETO swamp, but our work of cleaning the flies continues. Our struggle is not over. We will continue until the last puppet is rendered unable to harm Turkey"* is the clearest proof that this policy continues unabated.
29. Likewise, AK Party's Nevşehir MP Mustafa Açıkgöz, in his speech at the event held on 13 January 2023 at the Neuss branch of the Federation of Democratic Nationalist Turkish Associations²⁷ in Germany, the organisation of the Nationalist Movement Party (MHP) in Germany, said that²⁸ *they would "destroy the PKK and FETÖ members"* and added: *"We will not give them the right to live in Germany as we do not give them the right to live in Turkey. Wherever they flee to in the world, we will finish the*

26 Solidarity with OTHERS, Nefret Suçu Proje Kapsamı, <https://nefretsucu.com/proje-kapsami>

27 The Federation operates in Germany. The German Federal Office for the Protection of the Constitution accuses the Federation of violating the principle of equality of the German constitution because it defends the superiority of Turkishness, <https://medyanews.net/germany-monitors-groups-linked-to-turkeys-peoples-alliance-ahead-of-elections/>

28 "AK Partili Açıkgöz'ün Almanya'daki konuşması nedeniyle Ankara'ya 'nefret söylemi' uyarısı", 16/01/2023, <https://tr.euronews.com/2023/01/16/ak-partili-acikgozun-almanyadaki-konusmasi-nedeniyle-ankaraya-nefret-soylemi-uyarisi>,

terrorist organisation called PKK and the terrorist organisation called FETO.” The fact that he used the expressions “We will finish the terrorist organisation called PKK and the terrorist organisation called FETO” reveals that although eight years have passed since the coup d'état, hate speech continues to exist effectively and openly encourages violence. An MP can openly threaten members of the Gülen Movement with death in the centre of Europe.

30. On the other hand, it is seen that hate speech, which is carried out as a policy by the Erdoğan regime, is also used effectively by other parties, which have become a component of the regime and are called the People's Alliance. At this point, especially MHP President Devlet Bahçeli's recent statement “...*The fight against FETÖ continues relentlessly and unhesitantly. However, it is still not possible to say that this terrorist organisation has been eradicated. The process should continue until the last FETÖ member is neutralised...*”²⁹
31. It also reveals that the hateful, accusatory, insulting and violence-inciting expressions such as “*“FETO members, PKK members, enemies of Turks, elements of destruction, dishonourable people who are servants of foreign powers, separatists, those who have fallen into weakness are trying their last chance...”*”, which he used in his statement on 15 January 2023, are also used intensively by the member of the People's Alliance as an ally of the Erdoğan regime. The Minister of Interior, Ali Yerlikaya, who is one of the implementers of security policies, said about the persons detained in police operations: “We will never tolerate the **traitors** who aim at the unity and solidarity of our country,³⁰ ...our fight against the “FETO members” **who attempted to stage a coup against the will of our nation** [volonté générale] continue with determination³¹; ... we will not let the “FETO members,” **traitors** go, who **mercilessly opened fire on our people and did not hesitate to bomb our Veteran Parliament**; “we will not forgive those who **tried to steal the future of millions of young people with the exam questions they stole**, we will not let the **traitorous** “FETO” be tolerated”³²;... we will not let the **traitors** who opened fire on our people go;³³... we will not let the traitors

29 “Kripto damar koparılmış değil”, 21.07.2020, <https://www.odatv4.com/guncel/kripto-damar-koparilmis-degil-21072029-188074>

30 <https://edition.cnn.com/videos/world/2024/01/29/istanbul-church-shooting-isis-intl-ldn-vpx.cnn>

31 <https://x.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1747488174031450620?s=20>

32 <https://www.turkishminute.com/2023/10/24/turkey-detains-611-people-over-alleged-gulen-link/>;
<https://x.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1716736507128500236?s=20>;

33 <https://x.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1710527745011113998?s=20>

*who tried to crush us with tanks be tolerated;*³⁴ ...our operations against "FETO" who attempted a *treacherous coup on 15 July continue uninterrupted*"³⁵.

32. The Minister of Interior resolutely repeats such hateful expressions at every opportunity. The Minister of Interior makes these accusatory remarks about people who had nothing to do with the disputed coup attempt. The Minister's remarks indeed fall into the category of hate speech and violate the presumption of innocence of those arrested. These statements make it clear that the police operations and subsequent judicial measures were politically motivated governmental actions targeting persons considered to be members of the Gülen Movement.
33. These hate policies targeting the Gülen Movement have been used to legitimise unlawful practices such as arbitrary detentions, arrests, dismissals, confiscation of assets, closure of institutions and restriction of freedoms against the members of the Gülen Movement. In the hate speech used to ensure legitimacy, prejudice, misinformation fuelling enmity, conspiracy theories and propaganda discourses produced from a single centre have been used ruthlessly. Thus, through the hate speech and discriminatory regime practices imposed on the society, the members of the Gülen Movement were labelled as criminals who were left to die as civilians.

Conclusion

34. On the grounds of the 17/25 December bribery and corruption investigations involving ministers and bureaucrats of the Erdoğan regime, the hate policies against the Gülen Movement, which started as a party policy at first and turned into a state policy with the 15 July coup attempt, started to be implemented. The ultimate aim of these policies is to erase, marginalise, isolate and criminalise the Gülen Movement from society through violence, hate crimes and crimes against humanity. In this context, while the state has implemented its own hate and discriminatory regime practices in the strictest manner, it has also motivated the society and public opinion in this direction through hate speech.
35. By means of its institutionalised propaganda structure, the Erdoğan regime in Turkey has systematically and deliberately started to use the terms "*fetö, fetö/pdy, fethullahist terrorist organisation, traitor, putschist, virus, haşhaşi, agent, puppet, servant of foreign powers, etc.*" against the Gülen Movement in every incident in favour of the government or in every case where the government is in trouble.

34 <https://x.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1707627712817369184?s=20>

35 <https://x.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1676834343887437825?s=20>

36. Within the scope of hate policies carried out as part of a social engineering project, the members of the Gülen Movement have been excluded, marginalised, demonised, and ultimately turned into targets of state and citizen violence. As a result, hundreds of thousands of the members of the Gülen Movement have been forced to seek asylum in Europe in order not to be the target of further hate speech and crimes. According to Eurostat, the number of Turkish citizens seeking asylum in EU countries for the first time reached an all-time high as of September, before the end of 2023³⁶.
37. This hate speech, which was implemented as a policy, showed its effect in prisons, on the street, in the neighbourhood and in all areas of social, economic, and cultural life. As a result, while the members of the Movement were left to civilian death on the one hand they became victims of torture, ill-treatment, intentional injury, threats, and insults, which are crimes against humanity on the other hand. Within the scope of this extermination project initiated by the Erdoğan regime, everyone including children, young, old, sick, or pregnant associated with the Movement has indiscriminately become the target of the state's hate language and dictatorial practices.
38. This study, prepared by **Stichting Justice Square**, reveals that systematic hate speech and crimes have been committed against the Gülen Movement to explain the hate policies of the Erdoğan regime to the whole world, to identify the recent hate crimes and reflect them in international reports, and most importantly, to raise awareness in the international community on this issue.
39. Unfortunately, although hundreds of hate crimes have been committed against the Gülen Movement since 2016, these cases have not been reflected in the reports prepared. We hope that this study will contribute to the annual reports to be prepared by your organisation to identify and record hate crimes committed against the Gülen Movement in Turkey. We would also like you to know that we would be very happy to participate in the online meeting you plan to organise after January to discuss these issues.

Kind regards...

Stichting Justice Square

36 Applications for asylum lodged in Nov 2023 (n=118,000), 18.01. 2024, <https://euaa.europa.eu/latest-asylum-trends-asylum>